

THE USE OF PRINTED AND DIGITAL READING MATERIALS IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE LEARNING AT MTS NURUL HARAMAIN: A COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

¹RIA SAFNA, ²LALU THOHIR, ³MUHAMMAD AMIN, ⁴DEWI ELMIANA
¹²³⁴English Department, Teacher Training and Education Faculty, University of Mataram
e-mail: riasafnahanifatunnida@gmail.com

ABSTRAK

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui persepsi siswa terhadap bahan bacaan Cetak dan Digital di MTs Nurul Haramain dan mengetahui jenis bahan bacaan mana yang lebih disukai oleh siswa tersebut. Penelitian ini menggunakan metode campuran dengan desain eksplanatif sekuensial. Dari 5 kelas di MTs Nurul Haramain, 1 kelas (kelas A yang terdiri dari 30 siswa) dipilih secara purposif karena siswa di kelas ini lebih sering menggunakan bahan bacaan cetak dan digital dibandingkan kelas lainnya. Untuk mengumpulkan data yang diperlukan digunakan kuesioner dan wawancara. Data yang diperoleh dari kuesioner dianalisis secara kuantitatif dalam bentuk persentase dan data yang diperoleh dari observasi dan wawancara dianalisis secara kualitatif melalui kondensasi data, display data, dan penarikan kesimpulan/verifikasi. Hasil penelitian ini menunjukkan bahwa siswa bersikap netral terhadap bahan bacaan cetak. Ada beberapa pengakuan atas kelebihan, seperti kemudahan membaca dan fokus, tidak ada preferensi yang berlebihan. Sekitar setengah dari siswa bersikap netral mengenai penggunaan bahan cetak untuk berbagai kegiatan, dengan sedikit kecenderungan menyetujui manfaatnya untuk tugas. Selain itu, siswa mempunyai pandangan netral terhadap bahan bacaan digital. Sebagian dari mereka mengapresiasi kepraktisannya, sebagian besar masih acuh tak acuh atau ragu-ragu, terutama ketika digunakan untuk tugas dan persiapan ujian. Meskipun menyadari adanya manfaat tertentu, banyak siswa masih lebih memilih atau condong ke bahan cetak tradisional karena mereka menyadari manfaat tertentu dari bahan pembelajaran jenis ini dan mereka lebih ragu atau memiliki perasaan campur aduk mengenai manfaat format digital.

Kata Kunci: Bahan Bacaan Cetak, Bahan Bacaan Digital

ABSTRACT

The purpose of the study is to find out the students' perceptions on Printed and Digital reading materials at MTs Nurul Haramain and to know which type of reading materials is more preferred by those students. This research applied mixed method with sequential explanatory design. Out of 5 classes at MTs Nurul Haramain, 1 class (class A which consist of 30 students) was chosen purposively because of the students in this class used both printed and digital reading material more frequently than other classes. To collect the data needed, questionnaire and interview were used. The data obtained from questionnaire were analyzed quantitatively in the form of percentages and those data obtained from observation and interviews were analyzed qualitatively through data condensation, data display and conclusion drawing/verification. The result of this research showed that the students were in neutral stance toward printed reading materials. There was some recognition of their advantages, such as ease of reading and focus, there was no overwhelming preference. About half of the students were in neutral stance regarding the use of printed materials for various activities, with a slight inclination towards agreement on their benefits for assignments. Further, the students hold a neutral view toward digital reading materials. Some of them appreciated their practicality, most of them remain indifferent or hesitant, particularly when they used it for assignments and exam preparation. Despite recognizing certain benefits, many students still preferred or leaned toward traditional

printed materials because they recognized certain benefits of this type of learning materials and they were more uncertain or had mixed feelings about the advantages of digital formats.

Keywords: Printed Reading Material, Digital Reading Material

INTRODUCTION

Printed and digital reading materials represent two distinct formats through which individuals engage with textual content. Baron (2021) stated that printed reading materials refer to physical documents or publications that are produced using traditional printing methods, such as books, newspapers, magazines, and pamphlets. These materials are tangible and often involve ink- on-paper presentations. Printed materials have been a primary medium for disseminating information and knowledge for centuries, offering advantages such as portability, durability, and ease of annotation (Ghafar, 2024). Readers interact with printed materials through manual page- turning, highlighting, underlining, and jotting down notes in the margins. Additionally, the tactile experience of holding a physical book or document can enhance the overall reading experience for some individuals.

On the other hand, digital reading materials encompass electronic texts that are accessed and consumed through digital devices such as computers, tablets, e-readers, and smartphones (Baron, 2020). These materials exist in digital formats such as e-books, online articles, blogs, websites, and electronic documents (e.g., PDFs). Digital reading materials offer several unique features and functionalities, including searchability, hyperlinking, multimedia integration, and adjustable font sizes. These benefits collectively contribute to a more flexible, engaging, and accessible learning environment, ultimately supporting improved academic outcomes for students. Furthermore, digital texts can be easily shared, stored, and accessed across various devices and platforms, facilitating seamless reading experiences in different contexts.

Despite their differences, both printed and digital reading materials serve as essential tools for information acquisition, learning, entertainment, and communication (Sung & Chiu, 2022). Each format has its strengths and limitations, and individuals may have personal preferences based on factors such as convenience, accessibility, and sensory experience. The choice between printed and digital reading materials often depends on situational factors, reader preferences, and specific learning objectives. As technology continues to evolve, the landscape of reading materials will likely become increasingly diversified, with both printed and digital formats coexisting and complementing each other in various educational and recreational settings (Sorrentino, 2021).

In the modern era of digitalization, the traditional landscape of education has undergone a profound transformation. Particularly in the realm of language learning, the advent of digital reading materials has brought about significant shifts in pedagogical approaches and learning methodologies. With digital reading materials, teachers can assign readings and multimedia content as homework, allowing classroom time to be used for interactive discussions, problemsolving, and hands-on activities. This shift enhances student engagement and allows for deeper exploration of subjects during class time. The integration of digital reading materials with traditional teaching methods supports a blended learning environment, where students can benefit from both online and face-to-face instruction. This approach provides flexibility and allows students to learn at their own pace, leading to improved comprehension and retention. Amidst this dynamic educational milieu, the efficacy of print versus digital reading materials in enhancing reading comprehension, especially in the context of English language learning, remains a topic of considerable interest and scrutiny.

There have been some studies on the efficacy of print versus digital reading materials in enhancing reading comprehension. Pardade's (2019) study, for example, shows that digital reading encompasses numerous strategies akin to those utilized in traditional printed text

reading, including skimming, scanning, recognizing cognates and word families, guessing, predicting, activating prior knowledge, comprehending meaning, making inferences, and distinguishing main ideas from supporting details. Meanwhile, Baker and Driscoll (2022) research indicated that the overwhelming majority of respondents in the survey expressed a preference for and reported experiencing enhanced learning outcomes when utilizing purchased printed text material. The fact that most respondents reported better learning outcomes when using a purchased, printed text, suggests a clear preference and perceived efficacy of traditional printed materials over alternative formats.

Preliminary observations at Nurul Haramain Junior High School indicated a diverse range of reading materials being used in English language learning classrooms. These materials encompass both traditional printed texts such as textbooks, workbooks, and supplementary readers, as well as digital resources including e-books, online articles, and educational websites. The pre- observation phase also revealed varying levels of access and familiarity with digital reading materials among students, influenced by factors such as technological infrastructure, socioeconomic background, and pedagogical approaches employed by educators. Additionally, preliminary discussions with teachers and administrators suggested a growing interest in understanding the comparative effectiveness of printed and digital reading materials in facilitating reading comprehension among students, prompting the need for a comprehensive comparative analysis within the school setting.

RESEARCH METHOD

This research used mixed methods. The research was carried out at Nurul Haramain Boarding School. The population of this research was the 8th Grade of Junior High School at Nurul Haramain. The sample in this research was students from class A from the 8th Grade of Junior High School at Nurul Haramain, consisting of 30 students. This research used questionnaire and interview as the research instruments. The questionnaire items were closed-ended. The closed-ended questionnaire was based on the Likert scale. The researcher conducted interviews in the research to gather qualitative data and gain insights into the perspectives, experiences, and attitudes of the participants regarding printed and digital reading. The researcher interviewed 5 students of 8th Grade of Junior High School at Nurul Haramain those who really preferred printed and those preferring digital. In this research, the researcher divided data analysis into two: analyzing quantitative data from questionnaires and analyzing qualitative data from observation and interviews. The researcher analyzed quantitative data in the form of percentages. Meanwhile, in analyzing qualitative data, the researcher used data condensation, data display and conclusion drawing/verification.

FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Findings

1. Students Perceptions of Printed Reading Materials

Table 1. Frequency of Reading Materials

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I often read printed books for study purposes during the week.	8.33	29.17	62.50	0.00	0.00
<input type="checkbox"/> I often rely on printed books to complete school assignments.	8.33	58.33	33.33	0.00	0.00
<input type="checkbox"/> I frequently read printed books for personal purposes.	8.33	37.50	45.83	8.33	0.00

<input type="checkbox"/> I often bring printed books to school compared to digital books.	8.33	33.33	58.33	0.00	0.00
Average	8.33	39.58	50.00	2.08	0.00

The data suggests a prevailing neutral stance among students regarding their use of printed reading materials, with a slight inclination towards agreement, particularly when it comes to relying on printed books for school assignments.

Table 2. Advantages and Disadvantages

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I find that printed books are easier to read compared to digital books.	4.17	33.33	54.17	8.33	0
<input type="checkbox"/> Printed books are very effective in helping me understand the lesson material.	12.5	50	29.17	0	8.33
<input type="checkbox"/> I often have difficulty finding specific information in printed books compared to digital books.	12.5	33.33	20.83	33.33	0
<input type="checkbox"/> I feel more focused when reading printed books than when reading digital books.	0	41.67	45.83	12.50	0
Average	7.29	39.58	37.5	13.54	2.08

This data reveals that while there is a general preference for printed books in terms of ease of reading and focus, opinions are mixed, particularly when it comes to finding specific information.

Table 3. Preference

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I enjoy using printed books to understand long readings.	0	41.67	45.83	12.5	0
<input type="checkbox"/> When preparing for exams, I often choose printed books as my primary learning source.	29.17	25	45.83	0	0
<input type="checkbox"/> I feel more confident in my understanding after reading materials from printed books.	8.33	33.33	50	8.33	0
<input type="checkbox"/> In terms of learning efficiency, printed books are more effective compared to digital materials.	8.33	25	58.33	8.33	0
Average	11.46	31.25	50	7.29	0

This data highlights a general tendency towards neutrality among respondents when it comes to preferences for printed reading materials, with some leaning towards agreement but few expressing strong opinions.

2. Students Perception of Digital Reading Materials

Table 4. Frequency of Reading Materials

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I often read digital books for study purposes during the week.	0	25	58.33	16.67	0
<input type="checkbox"/> I often rely on digital books to complete school assignments.	0	20.83	37.50	41.67	0

<input type="checkbox"/> I frequently read digital books for personal purposes.	0	25	58.33	16.67	0
<input type="checkbox"/> I often bring digital books to school compared to printed books.	0	8.33	45.83	45.83	0
Average	0	19.79	50	30.21	0

This data indicates a general tendency towards neutrality among students when it comes to using digital reading materials, with a notable proportion leaning towards disagreement, particularly in using digital books for assignments and bringing them to school.

Table 5. Advantages and Disadvantages

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I find that digital books are easier to read compared to printed books.	0	20.83	50	29.17	0
<input type="checkbox"/> Digital books are very effective in helping me understand the lesson material.	0	37.50	62.50	0	0
<input type="checkbox"/> I often have difficulty finding specific information in printed books compared to digital books.	4.17	12.50	62.50	16.67	4.17
<input type="checkbox"/> I feel more focused when reading digital books than when reading printed books.	12.50	12.50	45.83	29.17	0
Average	4.17	20.83	55.21	18.75	1.04

This data highlights a prevailing neutrality among students regarding digital reading materials, with some leaning towards agreement but few expressing strong opinions.

Table 6. Preference

Questionnaire Items	Percentage (%)				
	SA	A	N	DA	SDA
<input type="checkbox"/> I enjoy using digital books to understand long readings.	8.33	37.50	45.83	8.33	0
<input type="checkbox"/> When preparing for exams, I often choose digital books as my primary learning source.	0	37.50	37.50	16.67	8.33
<input type="checkbox"/> I feel more confident in my understanding after reading materials from digital books.	0	33.33	41.67	25	0
<input type="checkbox"/> In terms of learning efficiency, digital books are more effective compared to printed materials.	4.17	33.33	41.67	20.83	0
Average	4.17	20.83	55.21	18.75	1.04

The data suggests a general preference for digital reading materials, though a significant number of students remain neutral, and some express disagreement with the effectiveness and confidence associated with digital learning.

3. More Preferred of Reading Materials

Aspects	Printed Reading Materials	Digital Reading Materials
• Frequency of Reading Materials		
• Advantages and Disadvantages		
• Preference	Neutral 50.00%	Neutral 50.00%
	Agree 39.58%	Neutral 55.21%

The data highlights a general neutrality among students when it comes to choosing between printed and digital reading materials, with some leaning slightly toward printed materials in terms of perceived benefits. The data suggests a general preference for digital reading materials, though a significant number of students remain neutral, and some express disagreement with the effectiveness and confidence associated with digital learning.

Discussion

The analysis of students' engagement with printed reading materials reveals a generally neutral attitude towards their use across various study-related activities. The majority of students remained neutral when asked about using printed books for weekly study and bringing them to school, though there was a slight inclination towards agreement when it came to relying on printed books for school assignments. On average, 50.00% of students adopted a neutral stance, with 39.58% showing agreement. Notably, there was no strong disagreement, suggesting that while students do not overwhelmingly favor printed materials, they do recognize their value, particularly for completing assignments.

The examination of respondents' perspectives on the advantages and disadvantages of printed materials reveals a generally favorable attitude towards printed books, particularly in terms of ease of reading and focus. While a significant portion of respondents find printed books easier to read and effective for learning, many remain neutral, indicating some uncertainty. The challenge of finding specific information in printed books is a more divisive issue, with opinions split between those who find it difficult and those who do not.

The respondents' preferences for printed reading materials reveals a general tendency towards neutrality, with only a minority showing strong preferences. For long readings, while 41.67% of respondents agree that they enjoy using printed books, a significant 45.83% remain neutral, and 12.50% disagree, indicating mixed feelings about the format's suitability for lengthy content. When it comes to exam preparation, 29.17% strongly prefer printed books, but again, nearly half (45.83%) are neutral, suggesting that while some students rely heavily on printed materials, many are undecided. Confidence in understanding after reading printed books also shows a similar pattern, with 50.00% neutral, indicating that many students do not have a strong preference either way. In terms of learning efficiency, although 25.00% agree that printed books are more effective than digital materials, the majority (58.33%) remain neutral.

The finding dealing with printed reading material is in accordance with the finding of the research by Baker and Driscoll (2022) with the title "Student Perceptions of the Learning Effectiveness of Printed Versus Digital Textbooks in College Accounting Classes". The findings reveal that a significant majority of respondents expressed a preference for learning with purchased printed texts over e-texts. This highlights the importance of considering students' preferences and experiences with different formats when designing educational materials and curricula in accounting education. E-books may not be as beneficial to accounting students as traditional printed textbooks. The majority of accounting students surveyed expressed a preference for purchasing printed versions, allowing them to take notes that they can keep permanently.

Drawing from the findings of this study, the evaluation of students' interaction with digital reading materials. reveals a prevailing sense of neutrality, with many students either unsure or hesitant about fully adopting digital books for their academic and personal reading activities. For instance, while 25.00% of respondents agreed that they often read digital books for study purposes during the week, a significant 58.33% remained neutral, and 16.67% disagreed. This pattern is consistent across other activities, such as completing school assignments and personal reading, where a large portion of students again opted for a neutral stance. The reluctance to rely on digital books is further highlighted in the context of school

assignments, where 41.67% of students disagreed with using digital books as a primary resource, and only 20.83% agreed. Similarly, when it comes to bringing digital books to school, a mere 8.33% agreed, while 45.83% disagreed, suggesting a clear preference for printed materials in this context. Overall, none of the respondents strongly supported the use of digital reading materials across the various activities surveyed. Instead, the data shows a strong tendency toward neutrality, with 50.00% of students adopting a neutral stance and 30.21% expressing disagreement, especially regarding using digital books for assignments and bringing them to school.

The students' reveals a general sense of neutrality, with mixed opinions on their advantages and disadvantages. For the statement "I find that digital books are easier to read compared to printed books," 20.83% of respondents agreed, while 50.00% remained neutral, and 29.17% disagreed. This suggests that although some students find digital books easier to read, a significant portion is either indifferent or disagrees. When considering the effectiveness of digital books in understanding lesson material, 37.50% of respondents agreed, yet 62.50% were neutral, indicating that while some students find digital books helpful for learning, the majority are indifferent. Opinions were more divided regarding the difficulty in finding specific information, with responses ranging from strong agreement to strong disagreement, though most respondents remained neutral. The statement "I feel more focused when reading digital books than when reading printed books" garnered 12.50% strong agreement and 12.50% agreement, but 45.83% of respondents were neutral, and 29.17% disagreed, reflecting a wide range of experiences with digital reading materials. On average, across all statements, only a small portion of respondents strongly agreed (4.17%) or agreed (20.83%) with the positive aspects of digital reading materials, while 55.21% remained neutral. Meanwhile, 18.75% disagreed, and 1.04% strongly disagreed, indicating that while there are recognized benefits, such as practicality, durability, and cost-effectiveness, many students are either undecided or not fully convinced of their advantages.

The students' preferences for digital reading materials reveals a nuanced perspective with a tendency toward neutrality and mixed opinions. For the statement "I enjoy using digital books to understand long readings," 8.33% of students strongly agreed, and 37.50% agreed, indicating that some students find digital books enjoyable for extensive reading. However, the majority either remained neutral (45.83%) or disagreed (8.33%), suggesting a lack of strong enthusiasm for this format. When considering the use of digital books as the primary learning source when preparing for exams, none of the students strongly agreed, and only 37.50% agreed. Another 37.50% were neutral, while 16.67% disagreed, and 8.33% strongly disagreed. This demonstrates a more divided opinion, with a balance between those who favor digital books and those who are neutral or opposed to their use for exam preparation. Regarding confidence in understanding after reading digital books, 33.33% of students agreed, yet 41.67% were neutral, and 25.00% disagreed, indicating that while some students feel more confident with digital books, a significant portion remains unsure or lacks confidence. For learning efficiency, 4.17% strongly agreed that digital books are more effective than printed materials, and 33.33% agreed, but 41.67% remained neutral, and 20.83% disagreed, reflecting mixed opinions on the efficiency of digital books. On average, only 3.13% of respondents strongly agreed with the positive aspects of digital reading materials, 35.42% agreed, 41.67% were neutral, 17.71% disagreed, and 2.08% strongly disagreed.

The findings about digital reading material in this study Support this study by Pardede (2019) with the title "Print vs Digital Reading Comprehension in EFL. This research aims to examine and combine existing concepts and research discoveries regarding digital reading within the English as a Foreign Language (EFL) setting. This research used a literature review as the research method. The result of this research showed that After 2010, most studies

indicated a preference for digital reading, although a minority still found advantages in printed reading or observed insignificant differences between the two formats in terms of comprehension. Potential factors contributing to this variability include the level of technological advancement in reading tools, participants' familiarity with technology, their proficiency in digital reading strategies, and their perceptions of digital reading.

The students generally exhibit a neutral stance toward both printed and digital reading materials. While there is no strong preference for either format in terms of frequency of use or overall preference, printed materials are slightly favored when considering their perceived advantages. This suggests that students may appreciate certain benefits of printed materials, such as clarity and ease of use, but they do not overwhelmingly prefer one format over the other. The neutrality observed across these aspects indicates that students may be adaptable to both types of reading materials, depending on the context or specific needs of their studies.

The finding dealing with printed reading material in this study is in line with the findings of research by Tanner (2014). The result of the research showed that print books are still the best suited to the optical, cognitive, and metacognitive requirements of the reading brain. While e-paper technology has been shown to be the optical equivalent of print on paper, e-readers still are lacking in the physicality that has been shown to be so important for comprehension. E-readers also lack the haptic qualities that readers enjoy about books, and seem only willing to give up only when convenience and portability are at a premium. In terms of metacognition, e-readers provide limited opportunities for text interaction, while virtual page turning has been demonstrated to discourage review of previously read material. Computer-read texts have all the limitations of e-readers without the superior optics of e-paper, and the added cognitive disadvantage of distractions from multitasking.

CONCLUSION

1. The students generally perceive printed reading materials as neutral when related to their frequency of reading materials. While there is some recognition of their advantages, such as ease of reading and focus, there is no overwhelming preference. About half of the students are neutral regarding the use of printed materials for various activities, with a slight inclination towards agreement on their benefits for assignments.
2. The students generally hold a neutral view of digital reading. While some appreciate their practicality, most remain indifferent or hesitant, particularly when it comes to using them for assignments and exam preparation. Despite recognizing certain benefits, many students still prefer or lean toward traditional printed materials.
3. Regarding preference of the reading materials, it was found that more students preferred printed reading materials because they recognize certain benefits of this type of materials but are more uncertain or have mixed feelings about the advantages of digital formats.).

REFERENCES

- Baker, P. E., & Driscoll, P. (2022). Student Perceptions of the Learning Effectiveness of Printed Versus Digital Textbooks in College Accounting Classes. *Journal of Accounting, Business and Management (JABM)* 29(1): 84-95.
- Baron, N. (2021). *How we read now: Strategic choices for print, screen, and audio*. Oxford University Press.
- Baron, N. S. (2020). Digital reading: A research assessment. In *Handbook of Reading Research, Volume V* (pp. 116-136). Routledge.
- Birch, B. M., & Fulop, S. (2020). *English L2 reading: Getting to the bottom*. London: Routledge.

- Coiro, J. (2021). Toward a multifaceted heuristic of digital reading to inform assessment, research, practice, and policy. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 56(1), 9-31.
- Ghafar, Z. (2024). The Impact of Electronic Books on Learning English Language in the Digital Era: An Overview. *Journal Of Digital Learning and Distance Education*, 2(7), 635-644.
- Malik, S., Qin, H., & Oteir, I. (2021). Perceived Psychological, Linguistic and Socio-Cultural Obstacles: An Investigation of English Communication Apprehension in EFL Learners. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(4), 733-752.
- Mantra, I. B. N., Widiastuti, I. A. M. S., & Pramawati, A. A. I. Y. (2020). Micro and macro skills of reading comprehension acquired by EFL students. *International Journal of Linguistics and Discourse Analytics*, 1(2), 10-17.
- Pálsdóttir, Á. (2019). Advantages and disadvantages of printed and electronic study material: perspectives of university students *Information Research*, 24(2).
- Pardede, P. (2019). Print vs Digital Reading Comprehension in EFL. *Journal of English Teaching*, 5(2):77-90.
- Ross, B., Pechenkina, E., Aeschliman, C., & Chase, A. M. (2017). Print versus digital texts: understanding the experimental research and challenging the dichotomies. *Research in learning technology*, 25.
- Sage, K., Augustine, H., Shand, H., Bakner, K., & Rayne, S. (2019). Reading from print, computer, and tablet: equivalent learning in the digital age. *Education and Information Technologies*, 24, 2477-2502.
- Sorrentino, P. (2021). *Does the medium matter? Digital vs. paper reading for leisure and foreign language learning* (Doctoral dissertation, Dissertation, Göttingen, Georg-August Universität, 2021).
- Sung, Y. Y. C., & Chiu, D. K. (2022). E-book or print book: parents' current view in Hong Kong. *Library Hi Tech*, 40(5), 1289-1304
- Tanner, M. J. (2014). Digital vs. print: Reading comprehension and the future of the book. *School of Information Student Research Journal*, 4(2), 6.
- Trasmundi, S. B., Kokkola, L., Schilhab, T., & Mangen, A. (2021). A distributed perspective on reading: implications for education. *Language Sciences*, 84, 101367.